# BEFORE THE ACUPUNCTURE BOARD DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS STATE OF CALIFORNIA

)

)

)

In the Matter of the Accusation Against:

TONI NARINS, L.AC. 3456 Camino Del Rio, #100 San Diego, CA 92108 Case No. 1A-2013-173

Acupuncturist License No. AC 4157

Respondent.

### **DECISION AND ORDER**

The attached Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is hereby adopted by the

Acupuncture Board, Department of Consumer Affairs, as its Decision in this matter.

This Decision shall become effective on <u>November 21, 2016</u>

It is so ORDERED October 21, 2016

Hildegarde Aguinaldo, Board President Acupuncture Board Department of Consumer Affairs State of California

	1			
	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	KAMALA D. HARRIS Attorney General of California MATTHEW M. DAVIS Supervising Deputy Attorney General JASON J. AHN Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 253172 600 West Broadway, Suite 1800 San Diego, CA 92101 P.O. Box 85266 San Diego, CA 92186-5266 Telephone: (619) 738-9433 Facsimile: (619) 645-2061 <i>Attorneys for Complainant</i>		
	10		RE THE	
	11	DEPARTMENT OF C	URE BOARD CONSUMER AFFAIRS	
	12	STATE OF C		
	13	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 1A-2013-173	
	14		OAH No. 2016031159	
	15	TONI NARINS, L.Ac.	STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AND	
	16	3456 Camino Del Rio, #100 San Diego, CA 92108	DISCIPLINARY ORDER	
	17	Acupuncturist License No. AC4157,		
	18	Respondent.		
	19			
<ul> <li>IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by and between the parties</li> <li>entitled proceedings that the following matters are true:</li> </ul>		IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGE	REED by and between the parties to the above-	
		re true:		
	22 PARTIES			
	23	1. Complainant Ben Bodea is the Interi	m Executive Officer of the Acupuncture Board	
	24	of California. He brought this action solely in hi	s official capacity as such and is represented in	
	25	this matter by Kamala D. Harris, Attorney Gener	al of the State of California, by Jason J. Ahn,	
	26	5 Deputy Attorney General.		
	27	///		
	27 28	///		
		///	1	

Respondent Toni Narins, L.Ac. (Respondent) is represented in this proceeding by 2. 1 attorney Walter Taylor, Esq., whose address is: 401 B. Street Street, Suite 2450, San Diego, CA 2 92101. 3 On or about July 11, 1991, the Acupuncture Board of California issued 3. 4 Acupuncturist's License No. AC 4157 to Respondent. The Acupuncturist's License was in full 5 force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought in Accusation No. 1A-2013-173, and 6 will expire on January 31, 2018, unless renewed. 7 JURISDICTION 8 4. Accusation No. 1A-2013-173 was filed before the Acupuncture Board of California 9 (Board), Department of Consumer Affairs, and is currently pending against Respondent. The 10 Accusation and all other statutorily required documents were properly served on Respondent on 11 or about February 24, 2016. Respondent timely filed her Notice of Defense contesting the 12 Accusation. 13 A copy of Accusation No. 1A-2013-173 is attached as Exhibit A and incorporated 5. 14 herein by reference. 15 ADVISEMENT AND WAIVERS 16 6. Respondent has carefully read, fully discussed with counsel, and fully understands the 17 charges and allegations in Accusation No. 1A-2013-173. Respondent has also carefully read, 18 fully discussed with counsel, and fully understands the effects of this Stipulated Settlement and 19 Disciplinary Order. 20 Respondent is fully aware of her legal rights in this matter, including the right to a 7. 21 hearing on the charges and allegations in the Accusation No. 1A-2013-173; the right to confront 22 and cross-examine the witnesses against her; the right to present evidence and to testify on her 23 own behalf; the right to the issuance of subpoenas to compel the attendance of witnesses and the 24 production of documents; the right to reconsideration and court review of an adverse decision; 25 and all other rights accorded by the California Administrative Procedure Act and other applicable 26 laws, having been advised of same by her attorney of record, Walter Taylor, Esq. 27 111 28 2

### STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AND DISCIPLINARY ORDER (1A-2014-77)

8. Having the benefit of counsel, Respondent hereby voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently waives and gives up each and every right set forth above.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

### **CULPABILITY**

9. Respondent does not contest that, at an administrative hearing, complainant could establish a *prima facie* case with respect to the charges and allegations contained in in Accusation No. 1A-2013-173 and that her license is thereby subject to disciplinary action.

10. Respondent agrees that her Acupuncturist's License No. AC 4157 is subject to discipline and she is to be bound by the Board's terms and conditions as set forth in the Disciplinary Order below.

### CONTINGENCY

11 This Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order shall be subject to approval of the
Board. The parties agree that this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order shall be
submitted to the Board for its consideration in the above-entitled matter and, further, that the
Board shall have a reasonable period of time in which to consider and act on this Stipulated
Settlement and Disciplinary Order after receiving it. By signing this stipulation, respondent fully
understands and agrees that she may not withdraw her agreement or seek to rescind this
stipulation prior to the time the Board considers and acts upon it.

12. The parties agree that this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order shall be null 18 19 and void and not binding upon the parties unless approved and adopted by the Board, except for this paragraph, which shall remain in full force and effect. Respondent fully understands and 20 agrees that in deciding whether or not to approve and adopt this Stipulated Settlement and 21 Disciplinary Order, the Board may receive oral and written communications from its staff and/or 22 the Attorney General's Office. Communications pursuant to this paragraph shall not disqualify 23 the Board, any member thereof, and/or any other person from future participation in this or any 24 other matter affecting or involving Respondent. In the event that the Board does not, in its 25 discretion, approve and adopt this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order, with the 26 exception of this paragraph, it shall not become effective, shall be of no evidentiary value 27 whatsoever, and shall not be relied upon or introduced in any disciplinary action by either party 28

hereto. Respondent further agrees that should this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order be rejected for any reason by the Board, Respondent will assert no claim that the Board, or any member thereof, was prejudiced by its/his/her review, discussion and/or consideration of this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order or of any matter or matters related hereto.

This Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is intended by the parties herein to
be an integrated writing representing the complete, final, and exclusive embodiment of the
agreements of the parties in the above-entitled matter.

8 14. The parties agree that copies of this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order,
9 including copies of the signatures of the parties, may be used in lieu of original documents and
10 signatures and, further, that such copies shall have the same force and effect as originals.

11 15. In consideration of the foregoing admissions and stipulations, the parties agree the
Board may, without further notice to or opportunity to be heard by Respondent, issue and enter
the following Disciplinary Order:

14

1

2

3

4

15

21

22

23

24

### **DISCIPLINARY ORDER**

## A. <u>PUBLIC REPROVAL</u>

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that respondent Toni Narins, L.Ac., Acupuncturist's License No. AC 4157, shall be and is hereby publicly reproved pursuant to California Business and Professions Code section 495. This public reproval, which is issued in connection with respondent's care and treatment of patient K.K. as set forth in Accusation No. 1A-2013-173, is as follows:

The Board finds that in your care and treatment of patient K.K. on or about September 16, 2013, you failed to clean one or more areas of patient K.K.'s body with an antiseptic, before insertion of needles, as more fully described in Accusation No. 1A-2013-173.

B. <u>COURSEWORK.</u> No later than December 11, 2016, Respondent shall take and
successfully complete not less than 8 hours of coursework in the area of Clean Needle Technique
7<sup>th</sup> Edition, offered by the National Certification Commission for Acupuncture and Oriental
Medicine (NCCAOM). The coursework must be approved by the Board prior to enrollment.

4

5

6

7

8

9

Classroom attendance must be required. Course content shall be pertinent to the violation(s). 1 The required coursework must be in addition to any continuing education courses that may be 2 required for license renewal. All costs of the coursevork shall be borne by Respondent. 3 C.

COST RECOVERY. Respondent shal pay to the Board its costs of investigation and enforcement, in the amount of \$4,000.00, lump sun, no later than the effective decision date. Failure to pay full costs by above due date shall constitute general unprofessional conduct and be grounds for further disciplinary action. The filing of pankruptcy by Respondent shall not relieve Respondent of the responsibility to repay the Board its investigation and enforcement costs.

#### ACCEPTANCE

I have carefully read the above Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order and have fully 10 discussed it with my attorney, Walter Taylor, Esq. I fully understand the stipulation and the 11 12 effect it will have on my Acupuncturist's License No. AC 4157. I enter into this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently, and agree to be 13 14 bound by the Decision and Order of the Acupuncture Board of California. I fully understand that, after signing this stipulation, I may not withdraw from it, that it shall be submitted to the 15 Acupuncture Board of California for its consideration, and that the Board shall have a reasonable 16 17 period of time to consider and act on this stipulation after receiving it. By entering into this 18 stipulation, I fully understand that, upon formal acceptance by the Board, I shall be publically 19 reprimanded by the Board and shall be required to comply with all of the terms and conditions of 20 the Disciplinary Order set forth above. I also fully understand that any failure to comply with the terms and conditions of the Disciplinary Order set for h above shall constitute unprofessional 21 22 conduct and will subject my Acupuncturist's License No. AC 4157 to disciplinary action.

23 24

25

26

27

28

DATED:

TONI NARINS, L.Ac. Respondent

STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AND DISCO'LINARY ORDER (1A-2014-77)

	I have read and fully discussed with Responder	nt Toni Narins, L.Ac. the terms and
2	conditions and other matters contained in the above S	Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order
3	I approve its form and content.	and the second second
4	DATED: 4 23 5016	en fight
5	WALTER TA Attorney for	AYLOR, ESQ
5		
7	ENDORSEN	<u>1ENT</u>
3	The foregoing Stipulated Settlement and Disci	plinary Order is hereby respectfully
2	submitted for consideration by the Acupuncture Boa	rd of California.
о	Dated: September 23, 2016	Respectfully submitted,
1		KAMALA D. HARRIS
2		Attorney General of California MATTHEW M. DAVIS
3		Supervising Deputy Attorney General
4		- UC
5		JASON J. AHN Deputy Attorney General
6		Attorneys for Complainant
7		
8		
9		
0		
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8	1	

14	1		
	2		
	3		
	4		
	5		
	6		
	7		
	8		
	9		
	10		
	11		
	12		
	13		
	14		
	15		
	16		
	17		
	18	×	
	19		
	20		
	21 22		
	22		
	23	Exhibit A	
	25	Accusation No. 1A-2013-173	
	26		
	27		
	28		
		1	

x A	-		
	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	KAMALA D. HARRIS Attorney General of California ALEXANDRA M. ALVAREZ Supervising Deputy Attorney General JASON J. AHN Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 253172 600 West Broadway, Suite 1800 San Diego, CA 92101 P.O. Box 85266 San Diego, CA 92186-5266 Telephone: (619) 645-2039 Facsimile: (619) 645-2061 Attorneys for Complainant	
	10	BEFORE THE	
	10	ACUPUNCTURE BOARD DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS	
	12	STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
	13	In the Matter of the Accusation Against: Case No. 1A-2013-173	
	14	TONI NARINS, L.Ac.	
	15	3456 Camino Del Rio, #100 San Diego, CA 92108A C C U S A T I O N	
	16	Acupuncturist License No. AC4157,	
	17	Respondent.	
	18		
	19	Complainant alleges:	
	20	PARTIES	
	21	1. Terri Thorfinnson (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in her official capacity	
	22	as the Executive Officer of the Acupuncture Board (Board).	
	23	2. On or about July 11, 1991, the Board issued Acupuncturist License No. AC4157 to	
	24	Toni Narins, L.Ac. (respondent). The Acupuncturist License was in full force and effect at all	
	25	times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on January 31, 2018, unless renewed.	
	26	111	
	27	111	
	28	111	
		1	

a K		
	1	JURISDICTION
	2	3. This Accusation is brought before the Acupuncture Board, Department of Consumer
	3	Affairs, under the authority of the following laws. All section references are to the Business and
	4	Professions Code unless otherwise indicated.
	5	4. Section 4955 of the Code states:
	6	"The board may deny, suspend, or revoke, or impose probationary conditions upon,
	7	the license of any acupuncturist if he or she is guilty of unprofessional conduct.
	8	"Unprofessional conduct shall include, but not be limited to, the following:
	9	" <u> </u>
	10	"(d) Aiding or abetting in, or violating or conspiring in, directly or indirectly, the
	11	violation of the terms of this chapter or any regulation adopted by the board pursuant to this
	12	chapter.
	13	··· ››
	14	5. Section 4955.2 of the Code states:
	15	"The board may deny, suspend, revoke, or impose probationary conditions upon the
	16	license of any acupuncturist if he or she is guilty of committing any one of the following:
	17	"(a) Gross negligence.
	18	"(b) Repeated negligent acts.
	19	"(c) Incompetence."
	20	111
	21	111
	22	111
	23	111
	24	111
	25	111
	26	111
	27	111
a.R	28	111
		2

6. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 1399.451, states: 1 "In treating a patient, an acupuncturist shall adhere to the following procedures: 2 " 3 "(c) Acupuncture points, where needles are to be inserted, shall be cleaned with an 4 appropriate antiseptic before insertion of the needle. 5 •• ..., 6 7. Section 4959 of the Code states: 7 "(a) The board may request the administrative law judge, under his or her 8 proposed decision in resolution of a disciplinary proceeding before the board, to 9 direct any licensee found guilty of unprofessional conduct to pay to the board a 10 sum not to exceed actual and reasonable costs of the investigation and prosecution 11 of the case. 12 "(b) The costs to be assessed shall be fixed by the administrative law judge 13 and shall not in any event be increased by the board. When the board does not 14 adopt a proposed decision and remands the case to an administrative law judge, the 15 administrative law judge shall not increase the amount of any costs assessed in the 16 proposed decision." 17 "(c) When the payment directed in the board's order for payment of costs is 18 not made by the licensee, the board may enforce the order for payment in the 19 superior court in the county where the administrative hearing was held. This right 20 of enforcement shall be in addition to any other rights the board may have as to any 21 licensee directed to pay costs. 22 "(d) In any judicial action for the recovery of costs, proof of the board's 23 decision shall be conclusive proof of the validity of the order of payment and the 24 terms for payment. 25 "(e) All costs recovered under this section shall be considered a 26 27 reimbursement for costs incurred and shall be deposited in the Acupuncture Fund." 111 28

1	COST RECOVERY	
2	8. Section 125.3 of the Code provides, in pertinent part, that the Board may	
3	request the administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed a	
4	violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of	
5	the investigation and enforcement of the case.	
6	FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE	
7	(Gross Negligence)	
8	9. Respondent has subjected her Acupuncture License No. AC4157 to disciplinary	
9	action under section 4955(d), as defined by section 4955.2, subdivision (a), of the Code, in that	
10	she committed gross negligence in her care and treatment of patient K.K. The circumstances are	
11	as follows:	
12	10. On or about September 16, 2013, patient K.K. went to M. V. Acupuncture facility, in	
13	order to receive acupuncture treatment from respondent.	
14	11. During the above visit, patient K.K. requested respondent to clean the areas of his	
15	body [with an antiseptic] where needles were going to be inserted. Respondent told patient K.K.	
16	that he was being "silly." Patient K.K. made a second request. Respondent cleaned a few of the	
17	areas, but not all of them.	
18	12. On or about October 6, 2014, Investigator Timothy Tottress from Department of	
19	Consumer Affairs, Division of Investigation (Investigator Tottres) interviewed respondent at M.	
20	V. Acupuncture. When Investigator Tottres asked respondent whether she uses alcohol on the	
21	skin to disinfect before insertion of an acupuncture needle, respondent stated that she does not and	
22	she is not required to do so by law. Respondent further stated that this is a "controversial" issue	
23	and according to her research, cleaning with alcohol merely moves bacteria to another area.	
24	Respondent also stated that if a patient requests alcohol, then she complies.	
25	111	
26	111	
27	111	
28	111	
	4	
	ACCUSATION	

1	13. Respondent committed gross negligence in her care and treatment of patient K.K.
2	which included, but was not limited, to the following:
3	
4	realleged as if fully set forth herein;
5	(b) Respondent, failed to clean all of the acupuncture points, where needles are to
6	be inserted, with an appropriate antiseptic before insertion of the needle.
7	PRAYER
8	WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged,
9	and that following the hearing, the Acupuncture Board issue a decision:
10	1. Revoking or suspending Acupuncturist License No. AC4157, issued to respondent
11	Toni Narins, L.Ac.;
12	2. Ordering respondent Toni Narins, L.Ac. to pay the Acupuncture Board the reasonable
13	costs of the investigation and enforcement of this case, pursuant to Business and Professions Code
14	section 4959;
15	3. If placed on probation, ordering respondent Toni Narins, L.Ac. to pay the
16	Acupuncture Board the costs of probation monitoring; and,
17	4. Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper.
18	
19	
20	
21	DATED: FEB 2 4 2016 An My mon
22	TERRI THORFINNSON Executive Officer
23	Acupuncture Board State of California
24	Complainant
25	
26	
20	
28	
	5 ACCUSATION
	ACCESS/HON